

Workforce Development in a Large Urban Setting: Student-Informed Lessons for the City Colleges of Chicago



Vanessa Coca, Rachel Blume, Flora Harmon, Amy R. Feygin, and Harry J. Holzer

Introduction

Serving approximately 9 million students per year,¹ community colleges in the United States play an important role in preparing students for employment in an economy with a strong demand for skilled workers. Traditionally, this preparation has occurred through community colleges' academic offering and student transfers to 4-year colleges to obtain bachelor's degrees. However, community colleges also serve students through their workforce development programs, which offer direct career preparation. On this pathway, students set out to obtain an occupational certificate or applied associate's degree that prepares them for "middle-skill" jobs—that is, jobs that require postsecondary training but no bachelor's degree. These jobs are often in high demand among employers and offer workers the chance to earn family-sustaining wages.²

In the United States, students of color and those from low-income households are disproportionately concentrated in community colleges, especially in workforce development programs.³ To maximize their employment opportunities, community college students need good information about the jobs and careers that pay well and are in strong demand in their regional labor markets; they also need good access to the workforce development opportunities that their colleges provide.

In this brief, we leverage interviews to shed light on students' perceptions of "good jobs" and their access to and experience with workforce preparation at the City Colleges of Chicago (CCC). The CCC Centers of Excellence are industry-aligned career and technical education programs that aim to provide Chicagoans with pathways to high-demand and well-paid jobs. Each of the seven colleges house one or more Centers, which in turn house programs in areas such as Advanced Manufacturing; Business and Professional Services; Construction Technology;

¹ Community College Research Center (n.d.).

² Holzer (2015).

³ See Baum et al. (2021).

Culinary Arts and Hospitality; Education; Engineering and Computer Science; Healthcare; Information Technology; and Transportation, Distribution, and Logistics.⁴ The Centers of Excellence model aims to deliver high-quality programs and instruction, innovation, partnerships with employers and communities, and access for students through flexible programming.

Exhibit 1. Map of City Colleges of Chicago



Each Center of Excellence is housed at a specific college. With seven colleges throughout the city, most Chicago residents have access to one or more City College (see Exhibit 1). In some fields, like business and information technology, students can take classes in any of the colleges; in others, like education, offerings are limited to some of the colleges. In yet other areas, such as healthcare or advanced manufacturing, course offerings are limited to the

⁴ Information Technology is not housed at a particular City College, but rather serves students districtwide.

colleges that house Centers focused on those areas—Malcolm X and Richard Daley Colleges, respectively. Because Chicago’s neighborhoods are highly segregated by race and class (or income),⁵ access to strong workforce preparation in specific fields at select colleges may be constrained for some residents.

CCC administrators wanted to better understand students’ perceptions of the labor market and the support they need to successfully complete credentials that will lead to in-demand, skilled jobs; they also wanted to know the extent to which the current set of workforce offerings at the Centers meet students’ needs. In fall 2023, AIR interviewed 23 students currently or recently enrolled in the Centers of Excellence. The study included at least one student from each college. AIR asked students about their perceptions of the labor market, how they make decisions about their programs of study and future careers, and the support they receive from the Centers to succeed in these programs. The full set of questions asked of students and a description of the methods used to conduct the study are in the Appendix.

THE PROMISE CENTER AND CITY COLLEGES OF CHICAGO PARTNERSHIP

The PROMISE Center at the American Institutes for Research has partnered with the City Colleges of Chicago to help strengthen the Centers of Excellence model by

- investigating whether and what populations have access to different Centers of Excellence,
- using labor market information to ensure programs and practices are driven by Chicago’s employment needs,
- building and integrating systematic approaches to work-based learning,
- creating data systems that can help the City Colleges measure and monitor their Centers of Excellence programs on key performance indicators, and
- ensuring that programs and practices align with the needs and perspectives of the communities served.

⁵ Frey (2022).

Key Findings

The study yielded the following key findings, which CCC can use to improve its Centers of Excellence model.

Students describe factors other than salary or benefits as important characteristics of good jobs.

Researchers' definitions of good jobs vary, but they typically focus on wages (e.g., offering a living wage, offering wages above the median for that occupation), growth opportunities, flexible scheduling, employer-provided benefits, and safe working conditions.⁶ However, when asked what makes a good job, CCC students tended to focus on other aspects of work; they discussed the importance of a supportive and caring work environment, having clear expectations and responsibilities, strong management and leadership, and deriving personal meaning or fulfillment from the job.

“A good job, for me, it would be a place where, one, it's open, like everyone is open-minded and it's a safe place for people to say their opinions and comfortable enough to respect each other's opinions first of all.”

—Ali

“To me, what makes a good job good is how fitting it is to each individual. One, is it what the person actually wants to do? Of course, a job can offer stability and such, but if that isn't what a person wants to do, then it doesn't feel fulfilling.”

— Candice

“I would think a good job will be a job that has flexibility, that offers a variety of shifts ... My main thing would be looking for a job that's like where that would give me a steady schedule. That will make it easier for me to plan in my life for my daughter, and I'd be able to plan things and have more freedom around her schedule if I know exactly what my scheduling is gonna be.”

—Tasha

“You need to have, you know, a fair workload ... positive leadership, you know? Positive, engaged leadership. Fair pay. Of course, you know, you need to be able to survive. And realistic scheduling.”

— Jeffrey

Less often, students touched on characteristics that are traditionally thought of as important to good jobs, such as wages, benefits, and flexible and predictable work arrangements. Students understood that flexibility and predictability would allow them to better manage duties outside of work, such as parenting, caring for other family members, and maintaining a household. This finding aligns with research that shows workers—particularly hourly workers—report higher well-being and happiness when they have both predictable and flexible schedules.⁷

⁶ Carnevale et al. (2015); Salmon (2018).

⁷ Golden et al. (2013); Henly & Lambert (2014).

Students' decisions to pursue a particular career are largely driven by factors other than labor market outcomes.

Consistent with findings from research on community college and 4-year college students,⁸ CCC students' decisions about their career fields are driven largely by factors other than future employment, earnings, and benefits. When asked why they chose a career field, many students said personal experiences influenced their interest in a particular career. For instance, one student described cooking with his grandmother and how those memories influenced his decision to pursue a culinary degree. Another student described a calling to pursue a career in the same field as members of his family.

Students also said their decisions were driven by a desire for personal satisfaction, meaning, and joy.

“ So definitely when I did enter the program. Obviously, I did want to help people. That was always my target. I always wanted to help people. Whether it be like marine biology, whether it be physical therapy, that's always been in my round house to kind of help people, no matter what.”

— Gordon

“ At first cooking was like well, cooking is like a stress reliever for me. That's my go to when I'm feeling, like, overwhelmed or something like I can always listen to music while cooking. I just get in my zone when I'm cooking, so I think that, you know, like I wanted to change my career from social services, and I felt like cooking would be something that I would enjoy doing. It wouldn't feel like work.”

— Ashley

“ I will say my family really like helped me out with finding my passion, especially my children. They like love my cooking surprisingly. It was getting picky boys to actually enjoy my food, and that just pushed me even more to like, learn different ways where I can entertain them through food as well as getting them to eat more.”

— Angela

“ And I actually did work as a CNA for a brief amount of time. But it wasn't for me. Like, I love people don't get me wrong. I love people ... It's not a people issue. Yeah, but my grandfather was a millwright, and my father was a carpenter. I just had that calling, you know that skill, trade, calling.”

— Jeffrey

Students spoke of previous employment in jobs where they felt unfulfilled or overworked or did not envision working in those positions long term. Other students avoided particular career fields after observing the experiences of their friends or family members. For example, one student described not wanting to pursue a career in healthcare, despite the perceived financial benefits, because they had witnessed a parent experiencing considerable stress within that field. “I know that my mom also works in the medical field, but as a nurse practitioner,” that student said. “But I felt that was too much to handle for me. Specifically, knowing all the information and then trying to take care of patient to patient in regard to specific illnesses or diseases.”

The fact that student perceptions of “good jobs” and their career choices are based so little on compensation and local job availability is a bit worrisome. This finding leads us to ask: Had

⁸ Baker et al. (2018); Wiswall & Zafar (2015); Stinebrickner & Stinebrickner (2014).

they been exposed to more career information before entering college—including more information on earnings and job availability across different industries in Chicago—would students make different (and perhaps better) choices about their pathways and careers, at least in terms of current and future compensation?

Students' options are constrained by practical factors, such as geographic proximity, program duration, and cost.

Students' decisions to attend a specific program or college were largely driven by pragmatic concerns, such as geographic proximity, cost, and program duration.

In a city as large as Chicago, students emphasized the importance of their college's geographic proximity to their homes, which would mean reduced transportation time. This rang true particularly for students with young children or other family obligations.

The cost of attendance and financial support available to students also played a pivotal role in their choice of program. Many students reported selecting programs that would be fully funded. Other students mentioned the importance of scholarships and tuition assistance programs such as Star Scholarship, which offers free tuition and books at any of the CCC campuses to graduating Chicago Public Schools students with a specific grade point average.

Finally, students reported valuing programs that would take less time to complete. When asked about other programs or fields considered before settling on their current program, students described being interested in other fields—like STEM, marketing, and nursing—but ultimately chose their program based on time constraints.

These observations suggest that CCC students, especially those facing major time or financial constraints, face limited opportunity in part

“ I would say it was like a combination of like convenience and location. It was just based around like my son's schedule for school. I didn't want to go too far. I didn't want to go downtown...So yeah, I think that it was just convenience, convenience for me as far my lifestyle.”

— Ashley

“ The main thing for me was financial aid. We don't have a lot of money; my family doesn't have a lot of money. I knew it would mean that I would have to work through school, and I was thinking about how engineering is a hard degree to get. I just wanted to focus on school. So, I came across City Colleges of Chicago...it's an automatic full ride for three years.”

— Oscar

“ I wasn't always into helping people I wanted to help animals instead. So, I wanted to be a marine biologist in particular, which I still do want to be. But due to financial reasons and time restraints, and everything like that, I just decided to go for something...a little bit less time consuming in terms of years, and then experience.”

— Gordon

because of the geographic distribution of Centers across the seven colleges versus where they live. As shown in Exhibit 1, Harold Washington (home of the Business Center) is in the downtown Loop, and Malcolm X (with all healthcare offerings) is on the Near West Side; both are relatively accessible to most Chicagoans. But Richard Daley College on the Southwest Side in a heavily Latino area, houses the Advanced Manufacturing Center; the location may hinder opportunities for Black residents who are interested in manufacturing but are heavily concentrated on the South Side—especially if they rely mostly on public transit. Wilbur Wright (in the Northwest part of the city) and Harry S Truman (on the North Side) also are further away, and their offerings in Engineering and Education, respectively, therefore might be less accessible to Black residents on the South Side, particularly those with school-aged children.

In contrast, Centers at Olive-Harvey and Kennedy-King Colleges, both on the South Side, are more accessible to these residents; however, students with less interest in the fields offered at those campuses (Transportation and Distribution Logistics, Culinary Arts, and Construction) face limits in opportunity. Our earlier analysis of enrollment patterns across colleges and fields of study indicate that Black students are more heavily concentrated in programs at those two South Side campuses.⁹

Students appreciate CCC support services but could benefit from greater flexibility and more connections with employers.

Generally, students were very positive about their CCC experiences. Most students interviewed said they “liked” and “enjoyed” their program and described their experiences in their program as “great” or “good.” All but one student said they would refer their program to a friend or family member. These positive experiences often were tied to students’ perceptions of a strong culture of care and supportive environment at their college.

Culture of care

Centers of Excellence programs and colleges offered a culture of care that often provided a buffer from challenges that students faced. Specifically, students referred to the care and compassion that their instructors, advisors, and deans provided. Caring instructors and advisors

“My professors. They really are ... so kind and compassionate, and they do everything here to make sure that you are passing your class. They try to give you as much information, materials, and, like, resources that can assist you outside of the classroom time. Because it's so short, the classroom time. A lot of the time studying is on your own. So, I would say the professors and their teaching and interactions would be my best part of the program.”

— Tasha

⁹ Feygin, Holzer, & Lee (2022). Other factors, such as the time required and the greater academic difficulty of more technical fields like healthcare at Malcolm X, might further limit opportunities at relatively accessible locations.

not only helped students navigate their program and class requirements; they also served as emotional supports during difficult times.

This culture of care contributed positively to students' experiences at their colleges. Several students, for instance, cited their professors or college faculty as the best part of their program. Students appreciated how professors demonstrated passion for their field of study, expressed interest in their students' lives, and provided additional support if needed.

Wraparound support

Increasingly, colleges recognize the importance of providing student supports that are comprehensive and holistic, including those that provide support for basic needs and mental health.¹⁰ Stressful experiences, such as difficulty meeting basic needs, can prevent students from completing college.¹¹ CCC students praised the wraparound support offered by their college and credited the benefits of those supports—particularly those related to mental health—with setting them on a path to complete their program. Several students referred to their campus Wellness Center and shared positive experiences with college-provided therapists or counselors.

Students also valued the financial supports available to meet their basic needs, such as those that address food and housing insecurity. One student who was experiencing financial hardship said an advisor from her program helped her identify resources both within and outside the college system to ensure her success.

“ For one part of the time, I was feeling like I was having panic attacks. I was just going through anxiety. So, they did sit me down with the wellness center, and I also spoke with some of the some of the therapists, and just got a lot off my chest that I probably couldn't have done outside of there or outside of school. ... So, like, to be able to just have a sit down and have someone just listen to you, or just be able to take like a little pressure off your shoulders and still encourage you and push you.”
— Angela

“ And as I mentioned, I was dealing with some financial hardships, and it's not like they were just like, 'Oh, here's some money,' or anything, but [my advisor had] been open to conversation to know what resources can help me with anything. City Colleges actually has a food pantry where you can grab a few things if you need to, which would help save money. ... It's great that [STAFF member] from [PROGRAM] has been able to hear me out, helping me understand what resources I did need, and always meeting with me, just to say, 'What's going on? What's happening here?'”
— Kellie

¹⁰ Feygin et al. (2022); Karp et al. (2021).

¹¹ Goldrick-Rab (2010); Maroto et al. (2015).

Scheduling flexibility

Just as students recognized the importance of flexible scheduling of jobs, they valued flexibility in the scheduling and format of college courses. Several students said they would like to see more variety in the class times and class formats (such as virtual, hybrid, or face to face) to better accommodate their interests and personal lives.

The lack of flexibility often limited the courses students could take, particularly for students juggling school, work, and parenting.

Connections to employers

Students emphasized the value of having opportunities to connect with professionals in the field. For example, several students in the same program mentioned attending a seminar in which different professionals—including alumni from the college—talked about their experiences in a particular job and answered questions. This opportunity enabled students to learn more about specific jobs within their field and connect with potential employers. Similarly, students reported receiving career support from faculty who connected students with potential jobs or introduced them to mentors who could provide career advice or insights from their experiences in a job.

Students also valued efforts from their colleges to connect them with work-based learning experiences. Students in practicums shared how their experience made them feel more confident about entering the workforce. For other students, participating in internships through their college helped validate their decision to pursue a particular career.

“... there aren't that many time options available, as far as like the times of the day. Sometimes they may have different instructors, but all the classes are at the same time. It's no time variation. Yes, I think it could be difficult for people, especially if you have children, the lack of time options that they offer available for the classes.”

— Tasha

“An [instructor] at my school actually introduced me to my mentor that I currently work with in my job now, and he's been helping me like the last 10 months. And he's like really supportive because at one point in time he was my age, and he has been helping me advance the stuff that I'm not familiar with. I'm grateful for both of them, and that's why I feel like I've just been nothing but supported going throughout my whole 3 years.”

— Raymond

“I think [internships] are really important, especially in your first years of like studying, because that's how you know that you really want to do these things. These past two summers, I've been doing an internship right here in [COLLEGE] ... It helps me see how maybe other careers weren't for me, and how I really like this, this job in the setting for like my future.”

— Sarah

Not all students had access to career readiness experiences. Some students said their programs did not provide mentorship or connections to jobs after completion. Other students said they felt that they had to network and learn on their own how to gain employment in their particular field. This experience was prevalent in programs that were not already connected to an internship or apprenticeship opportunity.

Students appreciated classroom experiences that closely simulated the challenges and dynamics they will encounter in real-world workplaces. Students also expressed interest in having either more practicum components in their coursework or opportunities to visit workplaces and shadow professionals in their field.

“That’s definitely something they can improve. They can improve on... with helping job placement of interviews... I feel like I’m going through so many loops to get an interview... Mentorship was something that I’m still searching for. And this field that’s like, it’s very important to me. I need some guidance on the field.”

— Betty

“Every 8 weeks we’re supposed to be at a location doing hands on skills like at a hospital or a clinic. And sometimes they aren’t able to establish that. So, then we have to spend that time here at the school. So, we’re not getting any hands-on practice in a real live environment, and that could possibly hinder us as a new grad, having not as much experience.”

— Tasha

Implications

Interviews with students enrolled in workforce programs associated with the CCC Centers of Excellence reveal important findings about how students perceive the job market and make career decisions in ways at least partly affected by “race and place.” The findings are consistent with what we have found in empirical analysis of enrollments across different programs and colleges to date, and in our ongoing (and forthcoming) quantitative work.

First, students consider a wide range of factors when making decisions about future careers and the programs of study that will prepare them for those careers. However, they consider their experiences and what they have heard from friends and relatives more than information about job availability in the Chicago labor market and the wages and benefits of particular jobs. Students may benefit from wider exposure to employment opportunities that could offer greater earnings potential and professional growth. This is also likely true for those enrolled in liberal arts fields (whom we did not interview) who face uncertain prospects for advancement to 4-year colleges and very limited compensation if they do not successfully transfer and obtain bachelor’s degrees.¹²

¹² Holzer & Baum (2017).

CCC should increase efforts to inform students about the availability of “good jobs” in the Chicago labor market as early as possible, and strengthen career guidance and exploration activities, so students can make decisions about which career to pursue informed by the best information about the Chicago labor market. Moreover, students could benefit from this information before transitioning into postsecondary education programs; perhaps through its partnership with the Chicago Public Schools, CCC can provide labor market and career information to students, as early as middle school and certainly by high school.

Second, students—particularly those who juggle multiple responsibilities—prefer affordable programs of study offered at colleges close to their home. Although a program of study that aligns with one's interests works well for students who live nearby, students without that proximity to their preferred program of study will not benefit. Moreover, access to programs of study, particularly those offering pathways to high-earning jobs, may be especially important for students who live in racially and economically marginalized neighborhoods.

CCC leaders interested in attracting prospective students to its workforce programs can help ensure access for all students in Chicago to the Centers of Excellence—whether through more transportation supports, better information about offerings, and the use of more satellite campuses to deliver services citywide. At the same time, we acknowledge the costs and limitations of doing so. For fields that require heavy equipment and infrastructure, such as manufacturing, it makes sense to locate their applicable Center at one college. CCC could provide free transportation, but the time costs of travel would still be prohibitive for some students; those with families stressed the importance of being close to home to manage childcare or other family responsibilities. For other programs, CCC perhaps could increase course offerings across colleges and increase the availability of online or hybrid courses.

Third, CCC provides holistic support services that recognize student success is driven by factors such as food, housing, and mental health. Students consistently report positive experiences in their programs because of a perceived culture of care, in which they feel supported by program staff and instructors. They also reported receiving wraparound support that addressed their mental health and financial needs. However, students described other programmatic factors that could improve their experiences, such as more flexible scheduling and greater connections with employers. Not all students had access to the work-based learning and mentoring experiences that not only are critical for skill development but also help students connect with employers and understand what is expected in a particular job or career.

CCC should strive to improve its efforts to reach out to regional employers, especially those in high-demand sectors offering good jobs, and to connect students with those employers, through work-based learning, mentorship, and job placement support.¹³

Over time, perhaps one of our top goals in Chicago, and across America, should be to reduce race and class segregation that limits education and labor market opportunities for millions of citizens. Until that happens, we can likely make some additional efforts to overcome the negative effects of segregation; the recommendations outlined in this brief would likely help.

References

- Baker, R., Bettinger, E., Jacob, B., & Marinescu, I. (2018). The effect of labor market information on community college students' major choice. *Economics of Education Review*, 65, 18–30.
- Baum, S., Holzer, H., & Lutmer, G. (2021). *Should the federal government fund short-term postsecondary certificate programs?* Urban Institute.
- Carnevale, A. P., Jayasundera, T., & Gulish, A. (2015). *Good jobs are back: College graduates are first in line*. Georgetown University Center on Education and the Workforce. https://cew.georgetown.edu/wp-content/uploads/Good-Jobs_Full_Final.pdf
- Carnevale, A., P., Smith, N., Van Der Werf, M., & Quinn, M. C. (2023). *After everything: Projections of jobs, education, and training requirements through 2031*. Georgetown University Center on Education and the Workforce. <https://cew.georgetown.edu/Projections2031>
- Community College Research Center. (n.d.). Community college FAQs. <https://ccrc.tc.columbia.edu/community-college-faqs.html>
- Feygin, A., Holzer, H. J., & Lee, J. (2022). The Centers of Excellence at CCC: Trends in enrollments and awards. Unpublished report.
- Feygin, A., Miller, T., Bettinger, E., & Dell, M. (2022). *Advising for college success: A systematic review of the evidence*. College Completion Network. <https://collegecompletionnetwork.org/resources/advising-for-college-success-systematic-review>

¹³ Through its partnership with CCC, the PROMISE Center at AIR is trying to help CCC to do exactly that.

- Frey, W. (2022). *Growth, diversity, segregation and aging in America's largest metropolitan areas: A 2020 census portrait*. Brookings Institution.
- Golden, L., Henly, J., & Lambert, S. (2014). Work schedule flexibility: A contributor to employee happiness? *Journal of Social Research and Policy*, 4(2), 107–135.
- Goldrick-Rab, S. (2010). Challenges and opportunities for improving community college student success. *Review of Educational Research*, 80(3), 437–469.
- Henly, J. R., & Lambert, S. J. (2014). Unpredictable work timing in retail jobs: Implications for employee work-life outcomes. *Industrial and Labor Relations Review*, 67(3), 986–1016.
- Holzer, H. J. (2015). *Job market polarization and worker skills: A tale of two middles*. Brookings Institution.
- Holzer, H. J. & Baum, S. (2017). *Making college work: Pathways to success for disadvantaged workers*. Brookings Press.
- Karp, M., Ackerson, S., Cheng, I., Cocatre-Zilgien, E., Costelloe, S., Freeman, B., Lemire, S., Linderman, D., McFarlane, B., Moulton, S., O'Shea, J., Porowski, A., & Richburg-Hayes, L. (2021). *Effective advising for postsecondary students: A practice guide for educators* (WWC 2022003). National Center for Education Evaluation and Regional Assistance, Institute of Education Sciences, U.S. Department of Education.
<https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/PracticeGuide/28>
- Maroto, M. E., Snelling, A., & Linck, H. (2015). Food insecurity among community college students: Prevalence and association with grade point average. *Community College Journal of Research and Practice*, 39(6), 515–526.
- Salmon, E. (2018). *Five elements of a good job*. Urban Institute. <https://www.urban.org/urban-wire/five-elements-good-job>
- Stinebrickner, R., & Stinebrickner, T. (2014). Academic performance and college dropouts: Using longitudinal expectations data to estimate a learning model. *Journal of Labor Economics*, 32(3), 601–644. <https://doi.org/10.1086/675308>
- Wiswall, M., & Zafar, B. (2015). Determinants of college major choice: Identification using an information experiment. *Review of Economic Studies*, 82(2), 791–824.

Appendix: Research Methods

This appendix describes how the study team conducted the interviews, including the sampling approach and the methods used to conduct the interviews and analyze the data collected.

Sampling approach

The sample for the study included 23 students currently or recently enrolled in a Centers of Excellence program. Names used in this brief are pseudonyms and meant to protect each student’s privacy.

In fall 2023, the study team worked with administrators at each college to identify students who would be willing to participate in an interview. College staff reached out to students in a Centers of Excellence program on behalf of the study team, and the study team followed up with each interested student to schedule a virtual or in-person interview. The study team offered \$25 Amazon gift cards to students as a thank you for their participation in the interviews. The breakdown of the number of students interviewed by college is in Exhibit A1.

Exhibit A1. Number of students interviewed by college

| College | Number of students interviewed |
|-------------------|--------------------------------|
| Harold Washington | 4 |
| Harry S. Truman | 3 |
| Kennedy-King | 4 |
| Malcolm X | 3 |
| Olive-Harvey | 1 |
| Richard J. Daley | 3 |
| Wilbur Wright | 5 |
| TOTAL | 23 |

Interview methods

Before conducting the interviews, the study team developed a discussion protocol. The discussion protocol was semi-structured and included open-ended questions to guide the

conversation. The protocol included questions related to students' career interests and fields of study, their experiences in their college and Centers of Excellence program, and their perspectives on jobs and the labor market (see below for the full set of questions). After the first few interviews with students, the study team discussed the protocol and made additional tweaks to it for clarity.

The study team conducted 60-minute interviews with each student, offering the choice to hold the interview virtually or in-person at their college. Each interview was audio recorded and transcribed. The study team developed a detailed codebook to support robust within- and cross-case analyses of the transcribed interview data using NVivo, a qualitative data analysis software program. Codebook development entailed two major steps: (1) the study team established a preliminary set of codes based on our key constructs of interest, and (2) the study team used this preliminary set of codes to code a sample of the interview transcripts, using deductive coding methods to generate a final set of codes. Throughout the analytic process, the study team engaged in regular communication to ensure consistent application of the coding structure, strategies, and rules for coding the data. Specifically, to ensure that data were coded consistently and reliably, the coding stage involved a multistep process that first included practice coding and double coding a subset of transcripts as an initial assessment of interrater agreement. The team then discussed and reconciled the few discrepancies in their application of codes and finalized the codes and code definitions to guide the subsequent coding process. Researcher independently coded a set of the transcripts and the full team met weekly to debrief, review, and discuss code applications and any challenges or questions arising throughout the coding process. Major patterns and themes also were identified and discussed to support shared understanding and interpretation of the coded data.

Interview questions

Let's start by talking about your career interests and field of study.

1. First, can you tell me what you are studying?
2. How did you become interested in this field of study? (Probe: Do you know someone else who works in [FIELD]? Did you receive information from [COLLEGE] about [FIELD]?)
 - Do you have a sense of whether there are a lot of jobs available/job openings in this field?
How do you know?
 - How likely are you to obtain a job in this field upon completing a credential/degree?
3. Can you tell me about other fields you considered? Why did you choose [FIELD] instead of those fields?

Now let's talk about the college you attend at CCC and your program.

4. First, can you tell me what college you attend?
 - Why did you choose this college? (Probe: Was location or cost a factor? What other factors influenced your decision to choose this college?)
5. Thinking about your specific program at [COLLEGE], can you tell me about this program and why you decided to pursue it?
 - Is your program related to your career goals? If yes, can you tell me how?
 - How did you hear about the program?
 - What other programs did you consider pursuing?
6. Can you tell me about your experience in [PROGRAM]?
 - What would you say is the best part about your program?
 - What would you say was the most challenging part of your program?
 - Overall, have you been satisfied with the quality of your program?
 - What could improve? (Probe: Curriculum? Class offerings? Class size? Faculty? Facilities? Connections to potential employers?)
 - Would you recommend your program to a friend or family member?
7. Is someone in your program or at your college helping you plan or prepare for meeting your career goals?
 - If yes: How are they helping you plan or prepare?
 - Is there anyone else helping you plan to meet your career goals? (If yes: in what ways are they helping?)
8. Are there any other supports, resources, or programs at [COLLEGE] that you have found helpful?
 - If yes: how did you hear about those support(s)? How often did you use those support(s)?
 - Are there any that you found were not helpful? Why aren't they helpful?
 - Does your college offer any resources or supports that you haven't used? (If yes: please describe why you haven't used them. How did you hear about them?)
9. Is there anything that your college (or program) could do to support you more in reaching your academic or professional goals?

Now, let's switch gears a little. We want to hear students' perspectives on jobs and the job market, as well as the types of training, certification, or degrees needed for specific jobs.

10. To start, from your perspective, what makes a good job good? (Probe: salary, alignment with your interests, prestige, etc.)
11. Can you tell me about how you get information about which jobs are good jobs?
 - Do you look at job postings? (If yes: how often?)
 - Does your program or college share this information with students? If so, how do they share it?
 - Does anyone else share information with you about good jobs? (Probe: Family, friends, work colleagues)
12. When you think of different types of job industries, like health services, IT services, and real estate, which industries are more likely to offer good jobs?
13. Can you tell me about what it takes to get a good job in those industries?
 - What kind of training, certification, or degrees are needed?



1400 Crystal Drive, 10th Floor
Arlington, VA 22202-3289
+1.202.403.5000 | [AIR.ORG](https://www.air.org)

Established in 1946, the American Institutes for Research® (AIR®) is a nonpartisan, not-for-profit institution that conducts behavioral and social science research and delivers technical assistance both domestically and internationally in the areas of education, health, and the workforce. AIR's work is driven by its mission to generate and use rigorous evidence that contributes to a better, more equitable world. With headquarters in Arlington, Virginia, AIR has offices across the U.S. and abroad. For more information, visit [AIR.ORG](https://www.air.org).

Copyright © 2024 American Institutes for Research®. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, distributed, or transmitted in any form or by any means, including photocopying, recording, website display, or other electronic or mechanical methods, without the prior written permission of the American Institutes for Research. For permission requests, please use the Contact Us form on [AIR.ORG](https://www.air.org).

Notice of Trademark: "American Institutes for Research" and "AIR" are registered trademarks. All other brand, product, or company names are trademarks or registered trademarks of their respective owners.

23377_01/24